

# Truro Board of Health 

Tuesday April 19, 2022
Regular Meeting- 4:30 PM

## REGULAR MEETING

## Remote Meeting Access Instructions

This will be a remote meeting. Citizens in Truro can view the meeling on Channel 18 and on the homepage of the Town of Truro website on the "Truro TV Channel 18" button found under "Helpful Links". To view, click on the green "Watch" button in the upper right of the page. To provide comment during the meeting, please call in toll free at 1-866-8994679 and enter the following access code when prompted: 972-302-709; or access the meeting from your computer, tablet or smartphone. httens://global.gotomeeting.com/ioin/972302709 There may be a slight delay ( $15-30$ seconds) between the meeting and the live-stream and television broadcast. If you are watching the meeting and calling in, please lower the volume on your computer or television during public comment so that you may be heard clearly. We ask that you identify yourself when calling in to help us manage multiple callers effectively. Citizens may also provide public comment for this meeting by emailing the Health Agent Emily Beebe at ebeebe@ruro-ma.gov with your comments.

## I. PUBLIC COMMENT

Please note that the Commonwealth's Open Meeting Law limits any discussion by members of the Board of an issue raised to whether that issue should be placed on a future agenda

## II. AGENDA ITEMS

1. Change of Manager: Ebb Tide Condominiums, 538 Shore Road
2. Addition of co-Manager: Beach Point Co-Op, 169 Shore Road
3. Change of Manager: Sladeville Condominiums, 2 Meetinghouse Road
4. Farmers Market: New Applicant - Ellery Althaus/Bagel Hound
5. Variance Requests/Local Upgrade Approval: 127 \& 133 South Pamet Road, Dennis/Wbitelaw (continued from the 4/5/2022 meeting)(The applicant has requested a continuance until May 3,2022)
6. Variance Request: 51 South Pamet Road, map 51, parcel 49
7. Discussion on Annual Town Meeting 2022- April 30 and outdoors

## 8. Groundwater Resources Discussion

## III.MINUTES:

## IV.REPORTS

- Report of the Chair
o Health Agent's Report


Health Department
P.O. Box 2030, Truro, MA 02666

FEB 092022
PH: 508-349-7004, Ext. 131 Fax: 508-349-5508
Email: ebeebe@truro-ma.gov or adavis@truro-ma.gov
APPLICATION TO NAME A MANAGER


This application is used for a Change of Manager, Add Co-Managers or to Name a Property Management Company as Manager with the Board of Health

## Section 1 - Business Information

Print Name of Applicant: EBB TIDE ON THE BAY
Business Name or DBA to be managed: EBB TIDE ON THE BAY Number of Units: 6 Street Address of Business: 538 Shore Rd Business Email:
info@rkmpropertymanagement.com

## Mailing Address of Business: ( $\square$ Check if New Address) 74 Shank Painter Rd, Provincetown <br> Section 2 - Manager Information

Name of Previous Manager: Peters Property Mgmt On-Site Manager Unit \#:
Name of New Onsite Manager: $\quad \mathrm{N} / \mathrm{A}$ $\qquad$ On-Site Manager Unit \#: $\qquad$ Name of Property Management (10 Units or less): RKM Property Management Mailing Address of New Manager and/or Property Management Company:74 Shank Painter Rd Provincetown 02657 Name of Co-Managers: Phone (24 hours/day): 508-487-1621 Email: info @irk mpropertymanagement.
com (24hrs/day):
$\qquad$ Unit \# $\qquad$ Phone (24hrs/day): $\qquad$ Unit \# $\qquad$ Phone (24hrs/day): $\qquad$ Unit \# $\qquad$ Phone (24hrs/day): $\qquad$
I have read \& understand the Board of Health Manager Regulation, Section III, Article 4. Signature of New Manager, Co-Managers or Contact Person for Property Management is required.

## 

## SIGNATURE

## SIGNATURE



PRINT NAME

PRINT NAME

$\overline{\text { DATE }}$


## IUVVN UP IKUKU



## APPLICATION TO NAME A MANAGER

RECEIV
This application is used for a Change of Manager, Add Co-Managers or Property Management Company as Manager with the Board of Health
Section 1 - Business Information
Date: _03/29/2022 $\qquad$
Print Name of Applicant: $\qquad$ Emil J. Kudryk
Business Name or DBA to be managed: _Beach Point Pagodas Number of Units: _24_ Street Address of Business: _169 Shore Rd Business Email: info@pagodas.com 781 Mailing Address of Business: ( $\square$ Check if New Address)_PO Box 371 N Truro MA 02666

## Section 2 - Manager Information

Name of Primary Manager: Frank Mira On-Site Manager Unit \#: _3 \& 4_
Name of CO-Onsite Manager: Emil J Kudryk On-Site Manager Unit \#: _19_ $\qquad$
Name of Property Management (10 Units or less): $\qquad$
Mailing Address of New Manager and/or Property Management Company: PO Box 371 N Truro M $/$
beachpointpagodas@g
Name of Co-Managers
_ Emil J Kudryk Phone ( 24 hours/day): 5087762117 Email:
beachpointpagodas@gmail.com
Name of Co-Managers:
_ Emil J Kudryk __ Unit \# __19__ Phone (24hrs/day): 7818447083_
Bill \& Kathy Dunn Unit \# _10 \& 11 _ Phone (24hrs/day): _5082771346_
_Rich \& Pat Small ___ Unit \# _25__ Phone (24hrs/day): on file
_ Katherine Buck __ Unit \# __ 7 __ Phone (24hrs/day): 9174035023

I have read \& understand the Board of Health Manager Regulation, Section III, Article 4. Signature ,


## SIGNATURE

SIGNATURE

SIGNATURE

PRINT NAME

PRINT NAME

PRINT NAME


DATE
DATE

DATE

# TOWN OF TRURO 

Health Department
HEALTH DEPARTMENT

P.O. Box 2030, Truro, MA 02666

PH: 508-349-7004, Ext. 131 Fax: 508-349-5508 MAR 232022
Email: ebeebe@truro-ma.gov or adavis@truro-ma.gov RECEIVED BY:
APPLICATION TO NAME A MANAGER
This application is used for a Change of Manager, Add Co-Managers-br to Name a Property Management Company as Manager with the Board of Health

## Section 1 - Business Information

Date:
Print Name of Applicant: Sladeville Cottages Condominium Trust
Business Name or DBA to be managed: $\qquad$ Number of Units: 9
Street Address of Business: 2 Meetinghouse Rd, Truro Business Email: info@rkmpropertymanagement.com Mailing Address of Business: ( $\square$ Check if New Address) c/o RKM, 74 Shank Painter Rd, Provincetown, MA 02657

## Section 2 - Manager Information

Name of Previous Manager: Breon Dunnigan
Name of New Onsite Manager: $\qquad$ On-Site Manager Unit \#: $\qquad$

Name of Property Management (10 Units or less): RKM Property Management
Mailing Address of New Manager and/or Property Management Company: 74 Shank Painter Rd Provincetown, MA 02657 Phone (24 hours/day): 508-487-1621 $\qquad$ Email: $\qquad$
Name of Co-Managers:

> info@rkmpropertymanagement.com


I have read \& understand the Board of Health Manager Regulation, Section III, Article 4. Signature of New Manager, Co-Managers or Contact Person for Property Management is required.


SIGNATURE

SIGNATURE


PRINT NAME

PRINT NAME


$$
\overline{\text { DATE }}
$$

## DATE

## Section 3 - **Office Use Only**

Team Inspection
(If over 3yrs since last one)


Board of Health Hearing


## A 2022-001

HEALTH DEPARTMENT TOWN OF TRURO
SUBMIT COMPLETED FORM TO THE HEALTH DEPARTMENT

## Town of Truro

 Farmers Market/Ag Fair/Temporary Food Service FFCEmFID BYprivate individual, organization or business


Authorized Representative or Contact:


Telephone
Requested Location/Facility Truro Farmers Merllet
Requested Dates $\& /($

## Requested Times

$\qquad$ Rain Dates/Times (Must be completed)

Before completing this application, read the temporary food service "Are You Ready?" Checklist. Have you read this material?


## 14KMLRS MARKET: FOODS TO RE SOHDNERVED

## Foods to be Sold/Served

(Packaged Baked Goods (breads, pies, cookies, cakes and confectionaries). Cream filled pastries, cheese cake or custard type
pastries prohibited.
$\square$ Seed sprouts

- Jams or Jellies
- Shellfish: Lobster, Crab, Oysters, Clams
- Finfish
- Vinegar with or without herbs

X Dairy: Milk or milk products such as cheese.

- Meat or Poultry(processed in a federal/state licensed inspected facility)
$\square$ Other:
Food Sampling: $Y$ or $N$ If yes, attach sampling protocol.


## Base of Operations

ㅁ Foods prepared/processed at a Truro licensed facility. Name of licensed facility: $\qquad$

- Foods prepared/processed outside Truro. Please attach a copy of your state or local food processing facility license, food establishment permit, food manufacturing license or residential kitchen permit and copy of your most recent inspection report.


## Market Manager Approval

As the Market Manager for the Truro Farmers Market, pique authorized the applicant to participate as a vendor. .


## AGRICULTURAL FAIR/TEMPORARY FOOD SERVICE

Menu: Attach or list all items. Any changes must be submitted and approved by the Health Department prior to the event.

## Organizations Conducting Food Preparation:

List Names of all staff with a Food Manager Certification: (non-profit organizations, school events, church suppers and fairs exempt).
1.

2. $\qquad$
Aivnacs
Exp. Date: 1,15124
Exp. Date: $\qquad$

List Names of all staff with an Allergen Awareness Certification: (non-profit organizations, school events, church suppers and fairs exempt).

1. Ellen

Exp. Date: $11,25,24$
2. $\qquad$ Exp. Date: $\qquad$

Base of Operation: (licensed fixed food establishment):

List each potentially hazardous food item, and for each item check which preparation procedure will occur.

5.
5.

SECTION B: At the booth:

| Menu Items | Thaw | Cut/ | Cook | Cool | Cold |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Holding |  |  |  |  |  |$\quad$

1. Bagels
2. Cream cheese
sell packaged or pack to order
sell packaged
3. 

Note: If your food preparation procedures cannot fit these charts, please list all of the steps in preparing each menu item on an attached sheet.
Food Sampling: $Y$ or $N$ If yes, attach sampling protocol.
I agree to any conditions specified by the Board of Health, 105 CMR 590.000 Minimum Sanitation Standards for Food Establishments - Chapter X, and the Federal 1999 Food Code. The above described establishment will be operated and maintained in accordance with the regulations.

$\qquad$

$$
\frac{02 / 16 / 2 a}{\text { DATE }}
$$

Board of Health Comments or Conditions:

Approved __ Not Approved ___



| From: | Benjamin Zehnder [bzehnder@zehnderllc.com](mailto:bzehnder@zehnderllc.com) |
| :--- | :--- |
| Sent: | Thursday, April 14, 2022 9:55 AM |
| To: | Emily Beebe; Arozana Davis |
| Cc: | Dave Michniewicz; Tom Dennis; David Michniewicz |
| Subject: | 127 South Pamet Road BOH review |

Hello Emily:
I am requesting that the Board of Health review for 127 South Pamet Road be continued until the Board's May 3, 2022 meeting.

My thanks and regards to you and the Board.
Ben

## Please note new email and contact information below and update your address book:

Benjamin E. Zehnder
Benjamin E. Zehnder, LLC
62 Route 6A, Unit B
Orleans, MA 02653
508.255.7766 - Office
508.246.4064 - Mobile
bzehnder@zehnderllc.com

This email message and any files transmitted with it contain PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION and are intended only for the person(s) to whom this email message is addressed. As such, they are subject to attorney-client privilege and you are hereby notified that any dissemination or copying of the information received in this email message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email message in error, please notify the sender immediately by telephone or email and destroy the original message without making a copy. Thank you.

EMAIL DISCLAIMER: We do not email Non-Public Confidential Information in a non-secure method. Accordingly, such confidential information, including account information and personally identifiable information should not be transmitted by non-encrypted email/email attachments. Use of non-encrypted email is inherently insecure. In no event shall we accept any responsibility for the loss, use or misuse of any information including confidential information, which is sent to us by email or an email attachment, nor can we guarantee receipt, accuracy or response to any email.

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.


# United States Department of the Interior 

NATIONAL PARK SERVICE<br>Cape Cod National Seashore 99 Marconi Site Road Wellfleet, MA 02667

Tract No. 12-2760 and 2761
April 5, 2022

Tracey Rose, Chair<br>Truro Board of Health<br>24 Town Hall Road, P.O. Box 2030<br>Truro, MA 02666

Dear Ms. Rose:

We are writing with great concem about relocation of a single-family residence formerly at 133 South Pamet Road in Truro, MA. The house at 133 South Pamet Road should not be allowed to be constructed on 127 South Pamet Road enabled by multiple variances. There are numerous reasons for this position: 1) inappropriate issuance of a new foundation building permit on a nonconforming lot, 2) an existing zoning violation in the Seashore District, and 3) the detriment of adding a house with additional bedrooms and expanding a septic system in close proximity to sensitive regulated resource areas.

The building permit for the foundation location that was issued given incomplete and inaccurate information is under appeal by an abutter; the validity of the permit is directly contradicted by the March 25, 2022, staff report written by Truro Planner-Land Use Counsel Barbara Carboni (see attached). Ms. Carboni refutes the lot area rationale used by the applicants, which is germane to the Board of Health and affects the total proposed bedroom count.

The septic system is proposed to accommodate three houses on a single-family property in the single-family Seashore District. As we have seen repeatedly it is not enough to say that a studio will not have a kitchen or to remove a kitchen. "Accessory dwellings" have been routinely rented out separately from a single-family residence. Please see the property's rental website https://www.ballstonbeachgetaway.com/ that describes that there is a kitchen in what they call the studio / cottage on 127 South Pamet already located on the property and separately rented; the existence of this house as a second single-family dwelling is a zoning violation. Since the applicants have a kitchen in the second house as per the house rental website despite assurances, the house to be moved could potentially become a third single-family residence rented out separately in a single-family zone, the Seashore District.

This request for additional bedrooms and septic system alterations further adversely impacts
sensitive regulated resource areas, including floodplain, coastal bank, and wetland and riverfront buffer zones, so the proposed siting of the house and expanded septic system is in a very vulnerable area that is not all upland; the floodplain here is routinely changing as the property is greatly impacted by the Ballston Beach overwash, so approval of state and local variances is not prudent public policy.

The Seashore District is a single-family residential conservation district, and we urge that high standards for special permits and variances be exercised. We hope that you will deny the variance application.

Sincerely,


Brian T. Carlstrom
Superintendent
cc:
Town Administrator
Town Planner

## MEMORANDUM

## To: Truro Zoning Board of Appeals

From: Barbara Carboni, Town Planner and Land Use Counsel

Date: March 25, 2022
Re: March 28, 2022 meeting
2022-003/ZBA (SP) Thomas P., Jr. and Kathleen C. Dennis, Individually and as Trustees for property located at 127 South Pamet Road (Map 48, Parcel 12) for special permits to 1) relocate a structure on a nonconforming lot under G.L. c. 40A, s. 6 and s. 30.7.A of the Zoning Bylaw; and 2) to exceed maximum Seashore District Total Gross Floor Area under Bylaw section 30.3.1.A.2.

This is a second application to the ZBA for zoning relief to relocate the dwelling previously located on 133 South Pamet Road onto 127 South Pamet Road. On January 24, 2022, hearing on the first application was continued, for 90 days at the applicant's request.

Since January 24, 2022, the dwelling has been moved to a temporary location (not on 127 South Pamet Road) following substantial erosion; the applicant has filed a building permit application claiming no zoning relief is needed to move the structure; the applicant has filed this second application to the ZBA; a building permit issued which allows the structure to be moved onto 127 South Pamet; and the building permit has been appealed. This memo reviews the prior proceedings; the above events; and the current (second) application for zoning relief.

Section I is a chronology with limited notes on dimensional and zoning issues raised. Section II discusses the original application to the ZBA and relief requested/required (summarized from earlier memos). Section III discusses the current application to the ZBA and the building permit application, as the contents overlap.

## I. Chronology

November 22, 2021 ZBA hearing opens. Testimony taken; hearing continued to December 20,

December 17, 2021
December 20, 2022

Application to ZBA for zoning relief to move house from 133 (Dennis) to 127 South Pamet (then Whitelaw). Application notes that " 127 is pre-existing and non-conforming under current zoning as to minimum lot size"; Zoning Table on plan identifies lot area as $73,200 \mathrm{sq} \mathrm{ft} /$ 1.68 acres, where 3 acres required. Relief required included variance for second dwelling on lot and special permit to increase intensity of existing nonconformity (lot area). See discussion below under "Original application to ZBA." 2021.

Dennis purchase of 127 South Pamet
Further hearing; continued to January 24, 2022.

January 17, 2022
January 20, 2022

January 24, 2022

January 29, 2022 Storm; further erosion at 133 South Pamet.
January 31, 2022 Applicant submits request to Town for use of Town-owned property (Ballston Beach parking lot) to stage moving the 133 house away from bank; also application for Emergency Certification from Conservation Commission.

February 2, 2022 Town grants application to use Town property; Conservation Agent grants Emergency Certification; both conditioned on Conditions attached to the Certification. ${ }^{1}$

February 2, 2022 Applicant signs agreement; house is moved away from bank and onto an abutting parcel (not 127) with owner's permission.

February 23,2022 Applicant's counsel submits proposal to Building Department contending house may be moved onto 127 South Pamet without requiring zoning relief, where kitchen will be removed, rendering structure a habitable studio. A new, conforming lot area asserted for 127 South Pamet (4.36 acres) based on Land Court plans from 1940s and inclusion of land "eastward of the coastal bank." Asserted that 127 and 133 lots will be combined and that based on revised lot areas, Seashore Gross Floor Area limit not exceeded. See discussion below under "Building Permit Application."

## ${ }^{1}$ Terms included:

1. The structure may remain in the temporary location for 12 weeks, during which time the owner must seek approval from the ZBA for any zoning relief necessary for the structure's siting and use at the permanent location.
2. The owner must submit revised plans and request(s) for zoning relief to the ZBA within 30 days of issuance of this Emergency Certification, including all information necessary for the ZBA to render a decision regarding the proposed permanent location. If the requested relief is not granted, the structure must be relocated and/or modified so as to conform to applicable requirements of the Zoning Bylaw.
3. The structure may not be occupied unless and until all zoning relief required has been granted by the Zoning Board of Appeals and occupancy is formally granted by the Town of Truro Building Commissioner.

February 24, 2022

February 24, 2022

Application for building permit filed for 127 South Pamet, work described as "House move and installation of wood pile foundation." Lot area stated as 4.36 acres. Proposed location with conforming setbacks shown.
Application submitted to ZBA for special permits "to relocate structures on nonconforming lot and under 30.3.1.A. 2 to exceed by right Seashore Gross Floor Area." Counsel's email states that if Building Commissioner determines no zoning relief required, application will be withdrawn.
Lot areas asserted: 127 South Pamet, 4.36 acres; 133 South Pamet, .32 acres, for a total of 4.68 acres, "based on the Zoning Bylaw definition that exempts pre 1987 from upland lot area calculation requirements." (see discussion below under "Building Permit Application"). Permitted Gross Floor Area asserted:3,936 square feet. Gross Floor Area of structures asserted: Boathouse, 1540 sq.ft; Studio, 725 sq.ft; dwelling, 1659 sq.ft. Total: 3924 sq.ft.

Includes correspondence to Building Commissioner asserting that with removal of kitchen, relocated structure will be habitable studio, allowed as of right; that with conforming lot area, no special permit required; and that with conforming setbacks, no dimensional variances required.

March 8, $2022 \quad$ Building permit issued with notation: "House Relocation Only. Zoning issues (if any) to be resolved prior to any occupancy."
March 17, 2022 Clearing and commencement of foundation construction
March 23, 2022 Appeal of building permit filed with Town Clerk.

## II. Original application to the ZBA (summarized from earlier memos)

On October 22, 2021, the owners of 127 South Pamet Road (Whitelaw) and 133 South Pamet Road (Dennis) applied to the ZBA for zoning relief to allow the relocation of the dwelling on 133 South Pamet onto the property at 127 South Pamet. The lot area of 127 South Pamet is 1.68 acres, nonconforming where 3 acres are required in Seashore District. ${ }^{2}$

Two residential structures existed on the property at that time, a dwelling constructed in 1892 and a second structure built in 2007. The original application referred to the second structure as a dwelling. According to Building Department records, the second structure was permitted as a studio. ${ }^{3}$ The 1892 dwelling is located 23 feet from the southern lot line, a nonconformity where 25 feet are required.

[^0]At that time, there was an agreement between the parties to move the dwelling to a location on 127 South Pamet. The proposed location was 38 feet from the front lot line, where 50 feet are required (Seashore District).

The relief requested at that time was a Special Permit under G.L. c. 40A, s. 6 and Section 30.7 and 30.8 of the Truro Zoning Bylaw to extend a nonconformity (from two to three dwellings on the 127 South Pamet Road lot); in the alternative, a variance for the addition of a second dwelling to the parcel. Applicant's counsel later acknowledged at hearing that the relief required to locate the dwelling onto 127 South Pamet would be a variance, not a special permit. A variance from the front setback requirement was also requested. As proposed at that time, the addition of a dwelling to 127 South Pamet at the proposed location would:

1. Increase the intensity of existing nonconformity of lot (nonconforming area), requiring a special permit
2. Create a new use nonconformity: two dwellings on one lot, requiring a use variance
3. Create a new dimensional nonconformity: front setback of 38 feet where 50 required, requiring a dimensional variance

Analysis of each request for relief follows.

1. Increasing intensity of nonconformity of lot (nonconforming area): special permit required

The lot is nonconforming as to area. Alteration, extension, or reconstruction of a dwelling on a nonconforming lot increases the existing nonconformity and requires a special permit under G.L. c. 40A, s. 6. Bjorklund v. Zoning Board of Appeals of Norwell, 450 Mass. 357 (2008). In this case, the proposal is to relocate an existing dwelling onto the lot, rather than to "alter, extend, or reconstruct" a dwelling. However, the impact of moving another existing house on to the property is at least the functional equivalent of such actions, if not more impactful. Accordingly, the same standard should be applied. ${ }^{4}$

The Board may grant a special permit under G.L. c. 40 A, s. 6 if it finds that the proposed reconstruction "shall not be substantially more detrimental than the existing nonconforming [structure and] use to the neighborhood." Likewise, the Board may grant a special permit under Section 30.7.A if it finds that:
"the alteration or extension will not be substantially more detrimental to the neighborhood than the existing nonconforming use or structure and that the alternation or extension will exist in harmony with the general purpose and intent of this bylaw."
In this case, where the proposed site of the dwelling relocation is approximately the same distance from South Pamet Road as its current location, approximately 50-60 feet to the south, a finding might be made that the relocated structure does not significantly change the streetscape,
${ }^{4}$ A modest addition to the existing dwelling or studio on 127 South Pamet would require a special permit under G.L. c. 40A, s. 6 . Moving an entire two-bedroom house onto the lot would unquestionably have a greater impact and more acutely increase the intensity of the existing lot size nonconformity.
and accordingly that the relocation is "not substantially more detrimental to the neighborhood" than the existing configuration. On the other hand, where the relocation will place a third residential structure on a single lot, approximately one-half the required size, a finding might be made that the relocation crowds the lot and would be "substantially more detrimental" to the neighborhood than the existing configuration. This and other considerations are entrusted to the Board's judgment, based on its "intimate understanding of the immediate circumstances [and] of local conditions . . ." Fitzsimonds v. Board of Appeals of Chatham, 21 Mass.App.Ct. 53, 55 (1985).

## 2. Creating a new setback nonconformity: 38 feet where minimum is 50 ; variance required

While the expansion of an existing nonconformity on a nonconforming lot requires a special permit, the creation of a new nonconformity requires a variance. Deadrick v. Zoning Board of Appeals of Chatham, 85 Mass.App.Ct. 539, 553 (2014). Under G.L. Chapter 40A, Section 10, a variance may be granted where a Board "specifically finds that:
[1] owing to circumstances relating to the soil conditions, shape, or topography of such land or structures and especially affecting such land or structures but not affecting generally the zoning district in which it is located,
[2] a literal enforcement of the provisions of the ordinance or by-law would involve substantial hardship, financial or otherwise, to the petitioner or appellant, and
[3] that desirable relief may be granted without substantial detriment to the public good and without nullifying or substantially derogating from the intent or purpose of such ordinance or by-law."

The Board must find all three of the above to grant a variance. Here, the variance requested is from the Bylaw's 50 -foot front setback requirement, to allow the dwelling to be located 38 feet from the road. ${ }^{5}$

## 3. Creating a new use nonconformity: second dwelling unit on lot; variance required

Relocation of the 127 South Pamet residence onto the 127 South Pamet lot would result in two single-family dwellings on a single lot. This is not a permissible use in the Seashore District (except where lawfully preexisting).
G.L. c. 40 A, s. 10 allows use variances only where expressly allowed by the municipality's zoning regulations:
"Except where local ordinances or by-laws shall expressly permit variances for use, no variance may authorize a use or activity not otherwise permitted in the district in which the land or structure is located."
${ }^{5}$ Further discussion of the variance standard and its application to this case is found in the Planning Department memo dated November 19, 2021 on page $3-4,{ }^{5}$ and in the Planning Department memo dated December 16, 2021 on pages 2-4.
G.L. c. 40A, s. 5 (partial). The Truro Zoning Bylaw does not expressly permit "variances for use," or use variances. In fact, the Bylaw expressly prohibits the Board from hearing use variances. The Bylaw provides:
$\S 60.2$ Board of Appeals A Board of Appeals consisting of five members and two associated members shall have the power conferred on it under Chapter 40A of the General Laws of Massachusetts and under this zoning bylaw, which powers shall include the review of Special Permit and Variance applications, except for Variances as to use, and the appeal of decisions of the Building Commissioner."
Bylaw Section 60.2 (emphasis added). Under this section of the Bylaw, the Board has no authority to hear or to grant the use variance sought for location of a second single-family house on 127 South Pamet Road.

## III. Building Permit Application and 2nd application to ZBA

Note: the building permit application and the second application to the ZBA are discussed here together; the filings are not identical but overlap substantially. Applicant's counsel advised at the time of filing that he would go forward with the second application to the ZBA if the building permit were not granted. The special permit application contains no argument apart from the arguments made in the building permit application. That is, there is no case made as to why special permits should be granted 1) under G.L. c. 40A, s. 6 and Bylaw Section 30.7 to relocate the dwelling; or 2) under Bylaw section 30.3.1.A.2. to exceed maximum Gross Floor Area in the Seashore District.

At some point, perhaps observing that obtaining ZBA approval to place a second dwelling on 127 South Pamet was unlikely, the applicants altered their proposal. The new proposal entails removal of the dwelling's kitchen to render it - assuming the Building Commissioner's agreement - a habitable studio. A studio is an accessory structure not requiring zoning relief. 127 South Pamet already contains a studio (in addition to a dwelling), but the Bylaw contains no express limit on the number of studios permitted on a lot. ${ }^{6}$ Assuming the Building Commissioner's agreement that removal of the kitchen would render the 133 dwelling a studio, and therefore permitted as of right on 127, the variance issue would be resolved.

Although the variance problem might be resolved, where 127 South Pamet is, as acknowledged in the original application, nonconforming as to area, addition of the twobedroom residential structure - even if technically a studio - increases the intensity of the existing nonconformity, requiring a special permit under G.L. c. 40A, s. 6. Bjorklund v. Zoning Board of Appeals of Norwell, 450 Mass. 357 (2008). As discussed above, although G.L. c. 40A, s. 6 speaks of "alteration, extension, or reconstruction of a dwelling" as increasing an existing nonconformity, the impact of moving an existing house onto the lot is at least the functional equivalent of these actions, if not more impactful.

The Building Permit application and related materials submitted do not use the nonconforming lot size of 127 South Pamet stated in the original application to the ZBA ( $\mathbf{7 3 , 2 0 0} \mathbf{~ s q . ~ f t / 1 . 6 8 ~ a c r e s ) . ~ I n s t e a d , ~ t h e ~ B u i l d i n g ~ P e r m i t ~ a p p l i c a t i o n ~ p r o v i d e ~ a ~ n e w , ~ i n c r e a s e d ~ l o t ~}$
${ }^{6}$ The Building Commissioner has also opined that there is no limit under the Zoning Bylaw to the number of habitable studios permitted on a lot.
area for 127 South Pamet and a lot area for 133 South Pamet with citation to the Zoning Bylaw definition of "Lot Area":
'Lot calculations show[ ] an area for 127 SPR of 4.36 acres, and for 133 SPR of 32 acres, for a total of 4.68 acres. This is based on the Zoning Bylaw definition that exempts pre 1987 from upland lot area calculation requirements:

Lot Area. The area of a lot when used for building purposes shall not be less than the minimum required by this bylaw for the district in which it is located. Such an area shall not be interpreted to include any portion of a lot below mean water level on fresh water, below mean high water on tidal water or within the limits of any defined way, exclusive of driveways serving only the lot itself. No less than $100 \%$ of the minimum lot area required shall consist of contiguous upland exclusive of marsh, bog, swamp, beach, dune or wet meadow. This definition shall apply only to lots created after April 30, 1987."

Email from counsel to Building Commissioner dated February 23, 2022. In other words, the argument appears to be:

1) the 127 and 133 South Pamet lots predate April 30, 1987; therefore, the current definition of "Lot Area" does not apply;
2) if the current definition of "Lot Area" does not apply, area other than upland - including area "below mean high water" - may be counted toward calculation of lot area; ${ }^{7}$
3) if the lot area of 127 South Pamet is calculated based on plans from the 1940s (prior to substantial loss of land to the ocean), rather than on upland area as it currently exists on the lot, the lot area of 127 South Pamet is 4.36 acres, exceeding the 3 -acre minimum;
4) where the newly-calculated lot area is conforming under the Bylaw, the dwelling structure may be moved onto the property as of right, without need for a special permit from the ZBA under G.L. c. 40A, s. 6 and Bylaw Section 30.7.

There is no explanation as to why these calculations and arguments were not asserted in the original application to the ZBA for zoning relief, which expressly acknowledged that 127 South Pamet was nonconforming as to area.

The Building Permit application and related materials further proposed to combine lots 127 and 133 South Pamet "by affidavit or Approval Not required Plan per [the Building Commissioner's] direction." See counsel's email of February 23, 2022. It was then asserted that

[^1]"The lot areas include land eastward of the coastal bank, but I believe those areas are included in lot area as the lots are pre-existing pre-1987 lots and therefore the entire land area is included for calculating Total Gross Floor Area permitted."
the combined lot area of 127 and 133 South Pamet - now claimed to be 4.68 acres - is sufficient to allow a Seashore District Total Gross Floor Area of3,936 square feet. ${ }^{8}$ The square footage of the three structures were provided as 725 sq.ft (existing studio); 1,659 sq.ft (existing dwelling); and $1,540 \mathrm{sq}$. ft (Boathouse dwelling to be moved onto property), for a total of $3924 \mathrm{sq} . \mathrm{ft}$. - in other words, falling below the calculated maximum permitted of $3,936 \mathrm{sq} . \mathrm{ft}$., and requiring no zoning relief.

The Building Permit application and related materials further stated that the proposed location of the dwelling conformed to all setback requirements on 127 South Pamet, requiring no dimensional zoning relief. Based on the above calculations and arguments, it was asserted that the Boathouse dwelling "may be moved as shown and used as a habitable accessory structure as of right by issuance of a building permit." See counsel's email of February 23, 2022. The building permit issued on March 8, 2022.

It should be noted that if lots 127 and 133 South Pamet are combined, as counsel proposes, the new lot would be one created after April 30, 1987, and thus not entitled to the benefit - assuming any exists - of the exemption from the Lot Area definition claimed by counsel so as to count "area" that functionally no longer exists. Neither the 4.36 acres now claimed for 127 South Pamet nor the combined 4.68 acres claimed would be available as the basis upon which to assert a lot conforming to the Seashore required minimum of 3 acres, or a lot area supporting a Gross Floor Area of $3,936 \mathrm{sq}$. ft . The combined lot area would be 1.68 acres ( 127 South Pamet) plus the current acreage of 133 South Pamet - under the Seashore lot area minimum, and supporting a Gross Floor Area substantially less than $3,936 \mathrm{sq} . \mathrm{ft}$. In other words, if 127 and 133 are combined, the lot area will be nonconforming, and a special permit required from the ZBA under G.L c 40A, s. 6 and Bylaw Section 30.7 in order to move the Boathouse dwelling to the proposed location. In addition, a special permit would be required from the ZBA under Section 30.3.1.A. 2 to exceed Seashore Gross Floor Area.

Finally, it should be noted that if the current definition of Lot Area is not applicable, as the applicant asserts, because the lots were created prior to 1987, the result is not that any/all acreage shown on earlier plans may be counted. Rather, if the current Bylaw definition is not applicable, the prior (pre-1987) version of the Bylaw definition of Lot Area is applicable. Under the Bylaw in effect prior to 1987, the definition of Lot Area provided that "no less than 75\% of the minimum lot area must be contiguous upland, exclusive of marsh, bog, swamp, beach, dune or wet meadow." In other words, the consequence of not being governed by the current definition of lot area would not be to eliminate the contiguous upland requirement, but rather to modify it from $100 \%$ to $75 \%$.
${ }^{8}$ Calculated as 3,600 s.f. for 3 acres and 336 for the next 1.68 at 200 sf per acre pro-rated. See email from counsel to Building Commissioner dated February 23, 2022.


April 8, 2022
Truro Board of Health
24 Town Hall Road
P.O. Box 2030

Truro, MA 02666
J.C. ELLIS DESIGN COMPANY, INC.

SEPTIC SYSTEM DESIGN \& ENGINEERING - SEPTIC INSPECTION SITE PLANNING - WETLAND CONSULTATION \& PERMITTING
P.O. BOX 81, NORTH EASTHAM, MA 02651 PHONE 508-240-2220 FAX 508-240-2221

EMAL jcellisdesign@verizon.net

## HEALTH DEPARTMENT TOWN OF TRURO

## APR 082022

RECEIVED BY

## Re: Variance Requests - Septic System Upgrade

Denton Family Revoc. Trust, c/o Jeffrey Denton 51 South Pamet Road, Truro, MA Assessor's Map 51 Parcel 49

Dear Board,
The Denton Family Revoc. Trust (c/o Jeffrey Denton) is proposing an upgrade of the existing cesspools at 51 South Pamet Road. Due to the proximity to wetland resource areas (flood zone), variances are required to install the new septic system:

Specifically, the following 3 variances are sought to install the new septic system.
Truro Board of Health Regulations - Section VI, Article 9

1. $83^{\prime}$ from proposed soil absorption system to flood zone
( 150 ' required, $67^{\prime}$ provided, $83^{\prime}$ variance requested)
2. 34 ' from proposed septic tank to flood zone
( $100^{\prime}$ required, $66^{\prime}$ provided, $34^{\prime}$ variance requested)
310 CHR 15.248
3. No reserve area provided.

Thank yorrfor your attention to this matter.


Jason C. Ellis, R.S., L.S.I.T.
fCC. Ellis Design Co., Inc.
Cc: file

## APPLICATION FOR BOARD OF HEALTH VARIANCES

Date: 4-8-2022
Property Owner's Name: Denton Family Revoc. Trust
Mailing Address: 8010 Mount Huron Trail, Colorado Springs, CO 80924

Address of Property: 51 South Pamet Road
Map and Parcel Number: $\quad$ Map \# 51 Parcel \# 49
Design Engineer/Sanitarian Jason C. Ellis, R.S.
Firm/Company Name: J.C. Ellis Design Co Inc Phone \#:508-240-2220
Address: P.O. Box 81, N. Eastham MA 02651

Please check type of variance requested:

- Title 5 Variance Request: Section 310 CMR 15.248
$\equiv$ Board of Health Variance Request: Section/Article Section VI Article 9




# J.C. ELLIS DESIGN COMPANY, INC. <br> SEPTIC SYSTEM DESIGN \& ENGINEERING - SEPTIC INSPECTION - <br> SITE PLANNING - WETLAND CONSULTATION \& PERMITTING <br> P.O. BOX 81, NORTH EASTHAM, MA 02651 PHONE 508-240-2220 FAX 508-240-2221 <br> EMALL jcellisdesign@verizon.net 

April 8, 2022

## Re: Variance Requests - Septic System Upgrade <br> Denton Family Revoc. Trust, c/o Jeffrey Denton <br> 51 South Pamet Road, Truro, MA <br> Assessor's Map 51 Parcel 49

Dear Abutter,
The Denton Family Revoc. Trust (c/o Jeffrey Denton) is proposing an upgrade of the existing cesspools at 51 South Pamet Road. Due to the proximity to wetland resource areas (flood zone), variances are required to install the new septic system:

Specifically, the following 3 variances are sought to install the new septic system.
Truro Board of Health Regulations - Section VI, Article 9
$1.83^{\prime}$ from proposed soil absorption system to flood zone
( $150^{\prime}$ required, $67^{\prime}$ provided, $83^{\prime}$ variance requested)
2. $34^{\prime}$ from proposed septic tank to flood zone
(100' required, $66^{\prime}$ provided, $34^{\prime}$ variance requested)
310 CMR 15.248
3 . No reserve area provided.
The Truro Board of Health will hold a public hearing to consider these variance requests on Tuesday, April 19, 2022, at 4:30 p.m. in the Selectmen's meeting room in Truro Town Hall, located at 24 Town Hall Road. If you are interested in attending the hearing, please confirm the hearing date, time and location with the Truro Health Department at 508-349-7004, ext. 32.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.
Sincerely
rasen C. Ellis, R.S., L. 8.I.T.
J.C. Ellis Design Co., Inc.

Cc: file

TOWN OF TRURO, MA

## BOARD OF ASSESSORS

P.O. BOX 2012, TRURO MA 02666

## Custom Abutters List







## SECTION DETAIL - COMPONENTS



## DESIGN CALCULATIONS

$\frac{\text { FLOW RATE: }}{4 \text { BEDROOM }}$
L BEDROOM DWELLING $=440 \mathrm{G} / \mathrm{P} / \mathrm{D}$ REQUIRED
( $110 \mathrm{G} / \mathrm{P} / \mathrm{D}$ PER BEDROOM $\times 4$.
( 110 G/P/D PER BEDROOM $\times 4$ BEDROOMS)
NO GARBAGE GRINDR
PROPOSED SEPTIC TANK.
440 G/P/D $\times 2=880$ G/P/D REQUIRED
USE 1500 GALLON SEPTIC TANK PROPOSED SOIL ABSORPTION SYSTEM
SIIEWAL $=(33+12.83)(2)(2)=183.32$ S.F.
BOTOM: $(33)(12.83)=423.39 \mathrm{SFF}$.

USE: (3) 500 GALLON LEACH CHAMBERS W/ STONE
AS SHOWN IN DETALL.

## NOTES

1. ALL PRECAST COMPONENTS TO BE H-20 RATED.
2. EEEVTION DAUMM IS N.A.V.D. 1988 .
3. 
4. MUNICIPAL WATER IS N.A.T.DVAILABLE.
5. ALL CONSTRUCTION TO CONFORM WITH 310 CMR 15.000

CODES AND RERGUPLTIOASLE LOCAL, STATE AND FEDERAL
5. INSTALER/CONTRACTOR TO REVIEW \& VERIFY AUI
5. INSTALLER/CONTRACTOR TO REVIEW \& VERIIY AL TO DESIINER PRIOR TO CONSTRUCTION OR ASSUME ALL
RESPONIBIITY
6. INSTALLER/CONTRACTOR IS RESPONSIDE TOR MUTALS
6. NAFE WORK ATEA, VERIFING ALL UTLITIES AND NOTIFYING
7. ANY SAFE PRIOR TO CONSTRUCTION.
7. ANY CHANGES TO OR DEVIATIONS FROM THIS PLAN MUST
8. FINIS
8. FINISH COVER OVER COMPONENTS IS NOT TO EXCEED 3
PER 310 CMR 15.000
9. AL ABANCONED SEPTIC SYSTEM COMPONENTS TO BE
10. ALL
0. ALL

ACCESS PORTS WTH BE, PROVIDED WITH WATERTIGHT

1. BEL SEPTIC TANKS, DIITRRIBUTION FONISH GRADE. AND PIPING TO
2. LEACH AREA. WELLS EXIST WITHIN 100' OF PROPOSED
3. THIS IS NOT A CERTIFIED PLOT PLAN AND UNDER NO
CIRCUMIATEES IS THS PLAN TO BE USED FOR BULDING
OR ZONING PURPOSES.
4. LEACH AREA TO BE PRIOVIDED WITH AT IEAST OUE

5. BULDING SEWER LOCATE AND VERIFY ELEVATIONS OF ALL
CONTRACTOR TO TAKE ALLEVATRNS MEANS NECROR TO CONTRUCTION. CONTRACTOR TO TAKE ALL MEANS NECESSARY (FLUSH TESTT
ETC.) TO LOCATE ALL EXISTING BULDING SEWERS PRIOR TO
6. C

BETWEEN BUILDING ANSALL CLEANOUTS ALONG SEWER LINES
SEPTC TANK AT ALL BENDS, JUNCTIONS
17. ANSTALL VENT WTH CHARCOAL FILTER ON S.A.S


DEEP HOLE DATA
PERFORMED BY: JASON C. ELIIS, R.S., S.EE,
WTTESESSED BY: AROZANA DAVIS, TRURO BOH


SEPTIC SYSTEM UPGRADE PLAN



[^0]:    ${ }^{2}$ In the Project Narrative, applicants identified lot area as 73,200 square feet and stated that the lot is "non-conforming as to minimum lot size."
    ${ }^{3}$ Assessor's records contain a comment "Has kitch[en] but no stove"; Building Department records do not authorize a kitchen in the second structure.

[^1]:    ${ }^{7}$ As counsel further stated:

